Corpus-Based Discourse Analysis Recent Developments and Future Directions

Philipp Heinrich

Computational Corpus Linguistics Group Friedrich-Alexander University of Erlangen-Nuremberg http://philipp-heinrich.eu

> Seoul October 1, 2018





PHILOSOPHISCHE FAKULTÄT UND FACHBEREICH THEOLOGIE

Computational Linguistics



source: Nautilus (Christopher D. Manning)

Corpus Linguistics

• a corpus

- is a collection of machine-readable texts
- can be processed and analyzed using methods from computational linguistics
- can be a sample of authentic language data and can as such be representative for a language (variety)
- corpus linguistics
 - creation and processing of corpora
 - analysis and interpretation of corpora
- research questions in corpus linguistics
 - main goal: research of language usage
 - empirical testing of linguistic hypotheses
 - language varieties and dialects
 - corpus-based grammars, psycho-linguistics, . . .



- Computational Corpus Linguistics
- Methods in CCL

2 Corpus-Based Discourse Analysis

- Basic Methodology
- Case Studies
- Extensions

3 The Future of CCL

- Deep Learning and CCL
- Towards a Hermeneutic Cyborg

Keywords

- keywords are words that occur more frequently in a text than what would be expected assuming random variation
- keywords are calculated with respect to a reference corpus

Keywords

- keywords are words that occur more frequently in a text than what would be expected assuming random variation
- keywords are calculated with respect to a reference corpus
- contingency table of observed frequencies for every word w:

	corpus 1	corpus 2
W	k_1	k ₂
$\neg W$	$n_1 - k_1$	$n_2 - k_2$

Keywords

- keywords are words that occur more frequently in a text than what would be expected assuming random variation
- keywords are calculated with respect to a reference corpus
- contingency table of observed frequencies for every word w:

	corpus 1	corpus 2	
W	$O := O_{11}$	<i>O</i> ₁₂	$= R_1$
$\neg W$	<i>O</i> ₂₁	<i>O</i> ₂₂	$= R_2$
	$= C_1$	$= C_2$	= N

Indifference (Independence)

- association measures (AMs) provide a quantification of the divergence of observed frequencies from their expected frequencies s.t. independence in contingency table
- indifference table:

-			1	1
		corpus 1	corpus 2	
	W	$E := E_{11} = \frac{R_1 C_1}{N}$	$E_{12} = \frac{R_1 C_2}{N}$	$= R_1$
	$\neg W$	$E_{21} = \frac{R_2 C_1}{N}$	$E_{22} = \frac{R_2 C_2}{N}$	$= R_2$
		$= C_1$	$= C_2$	= N

Statistical Association Measures

	corpus 1	corpus 2	
W	O_{11} vs. E_{11}	O_{12} vs. E_{12}	R_1
$\neg W$	O_{21} vs. E_{21}	O_{22} vs. E_{22}	R_2
	$= C_1$	$= C_2$	= N



Collocations

- distributional hypothesis (Firth, 1957):
 - "you shall know a word by the company it keeps"
 - "one of the meanings of night is its collocability with dark, and of dark, of course, its collocation with night"
- collocations are based on observed co-occurrence frequencies of word pairs (w1, w2):

	<i>W</i> ₂	$\neg w_2$	
w ₁	<i>O</i> ₁₁	<i>O</i> ₁₂	$= R_1$
$\neg w_1$	<i>O</i> ₂₁	<i>O</i> ₂₂	$= R_2$
	$= C_1$	$= C_2$	= N

Collocations

- distributional hypothesis (Firth, 1957):
 - "you shall know a word by the company it keeps"
 - "one of the meanings of night is its collocability with dark, and of dark, of course, its collocation with night"
- collocations are based on observed co-occurrence frequencies of word pairs (w1, w2):

	<i>W</i> ₂	$\neg w_2$	
w ₁	<i>O</i> ₁₁	<i>O</i> ₁₂	$= R_1$
$\neg w_1$	<i>O</i> ₂₁	<i>O</i> ₂₂	$= R_2$
	$= C_1$	$= C_2$	= N

• different types of co-occurrence

Methods in CCL

Surface Co-occurrence

A vast deal of coolness and a peculiar degree of judgement, are <u>requisite in catching a hat</u>. A man must not be precipitate, or he runs over it ; he must not rush into the opposite extreme, or he loses it altogether. [...] There was a fine gentle <u>wind, and Mr. Pickwick's hat rolled sportively before it</u>. The wind puffed, and Mr. <u>Pickwick puffed, and the hat rolled over and over</u> as merrily as a lively porpoise in a strong tide ; and on it might have *rolled*, far beyond Mr. Pickwick's reach, had not its course been providentially stopped, just as that gentleman was on the point of resigning it to its fate.

Textual Co-occurrence

A vast deal of coolness and a peculiar degree of judgement, are requisite in catching a <u>hat</u> .	hat	_
A man must not be precipitate, or he runs over it;	—	over
he must not rush into the opposite extreme, or he loses it altogether.	_	—
There was a fine gentle wind, and Mr. Pickwick's <u>hat</u> rolled sportively before it.	hat	—
The wind puffed, and Mr. Pickwick puffed, and the <u>hat</u> rolled <i>over</i> and <i>over</i> as merrily as a lively porpoise in a strong tide ;	hat	over

Syntactic Co-occurrence

In an open barouche [...] stood a stout old gentleman, in a blue coat and bright buttons, corduroy breeches and top-boots; two young ladies in scarfs and feathers; a young gentleman apparently enamoured of one of the young ladies in scarfs and feathers; a lady of doubtful age, probably the aunt of the aforesaid; and [...]

Collocates of *bucket* (noun)

noun	f	verb	f	adjective	f
water	183	throw	36	large	37
spade	31	fill	29	single-record	5
plastic	36	randomize	9	cold	13
slop	14	empty	14	galvanized	4
size	41	tip	10	ten-record	3
тор	16	kick	12	full	20
record	38	hold	31	empty	9
bucket	18	carry	26	steaming	4
ice	22	put	36	full-track	2
seat	20	chuck	7	multi-record	2
coal	16	weep	7	small	21
density	11	pour	9	leaky	3
brigade	10	douse	4	bottomless	3
algorithm	9	fetch	7	galvanised	3
shovel	7	store	7	iced	3
container	10	drop	9	clean	7
oats	7	pick	11	wooden	6
sand	12	use	31	old	19
Rhino	7	tire	3	ice-cold	2
champagne	10	rinse	3	anti-sweat	1

Philipp Heinrich, MSc (FAU)

Introduction

- Computational Corpus Linguistics
- Methods in CCL

2 Corpus-Based Discourse Analysis

- Basic Methodology
- Case Studies
- Extensions

3 The Future of CCL

- Deep Learning and CCL
- Towards a Hermeneutic Cyborg

From Text to Discourse

- Foucault (1969): discourses as statements in conversation
- interpretation of text means categorizing
 - utterances
 - sentences
 - paragraphs
 - tweets

From Text to Discourse

- Foucault (1969): discourses as statements in conversation
- interpretation of text means categorizing
 - utterances
 - sentences
 - paragraphs
 - tweets
- the categories
 - are not known a priori
 - must be made up on the fly by the hermeneutic interpreter
- CDA is fundamentally different from (statistical) text classification
- ultimate goal of critical discourse analysis: *discover* what is said by whom (power relations)

Concordances

No	Text	Solution 1 to 50 Page 1 / 6				
1	text000001	UNDEF 현재 의 상황 은 장기 적 이 ㄴ 민주 발전 중 의 한 시련 과정 이 ㄹ 뿐 이 지	대한민국	자체 가 흔들리 는 최악 의 상황 은 아니 라고 보 ㄴ다 .		
2	text000001	UNDEF 김학준 김학준 이번 정상 회담 은 문자 그대로	대한민국	의 자주 외교 시대 를 열 는 획기 적 이 ㄴ 사건 이 ㅂ니다 .		
3	text000001	UNDEF 우리	대한민국	은 88 서울 올림픽 을 계기 로 바라 ㅁ 을 '받아들이는' 입장 에서 , 바라 ㅁ 을 ' 불어 내 는 ' 곳		
4	text000001	UNDEF 이 와 같 은	대한민국	에 대한 인식 의 대 전환 이 소련 을 우리 에게 다가오 게 하 고 있 는 것 이 ㅂ니다 .		
5	text000001	·지국장) 데이비드 파우어스 (42 ㅅ wBBC 방송 동경 특파원) 데이비드 파우어스 파우어스	대한민국	정부 가 지난 2 일 발표 하 ㄴ 민족 대 교류 기간 (13 17 일) 중 ' 선별 적 이 ㄴ 방복 허용 방촌		
6	text000001	UNDEF 이런 점 에서 보 면	대한민국	정부 가 북한 으로 가 고자 하 는 사람 들 에게 굳이 사전 허락 을 받 도록 요구 하 ㄹ 필요 가 있		
7	text000001	UNDEF 파우어스 파우어스 며칠 전	대한민국	의 정부 관계자 한 사람 을 만나 았 습니다 .		
8	text000001	UNDEF 파우어스 파우어스 북한 이 대화 의 상대 에서	대한민국	정부 를 제처놓 고 전민련 - 전대협등 재야 단체 만 을 상대 하 곘 다고 하 았 을 때 세계 사람 동		
9	text000001	UNDEF	대한민국	임시 정부 수립 71 주년 기념일 (13 일) 을 맞 아 정부 로부터 건국 훈장 국민장 을 추서 받 은		
10	text000001	UNDEF *8 일 가네마루 씨 의 방한 때 도 설명 이 있 겠 지만 , 일본 도	대한민국	의 뜻 을 거스르 고 북한 과 수교 하 아 무슨 도움 이 되 ㄹ 것 이 ㄴ가 를 판단 하 게 되 ㄹ 것 으		
11	text000001	서떻 게 방송 하 았 는지 / " 감상 적 내용 없애 라 원고 까지 군 검열 " 지금 까지 여러분 제서 는	대한민국	서울 에서 방송 하 아 드리 ㄴ DBS 동아 방송 을 든 으시 었 습니다 .		
12	text000001	UNDEF 중국 은 최근 평양 에	대한민국	무역 대표부 를 두 라고 권유 하 기 도 하 았 다고 들 었 습니다 .		
13	text000001	}서 어야 / 윗사람 눈치 안보 는 소신 과 기개 절실 / 공직자 는 청렴 하 아야 바른 길 안 벗 어나	대한민국	헌법 은 '모든 국민 은 법 앞 에 평 등하 다 '고 선언 하고 있 다 .		
14	text000001	UNDEF 북한 이 UN 가입 결정 발표 후 에 도 여전히 중앙 방송 등 을 통하 아 '	<u>대한민국</u>	은 미제 의 괴뢰 ' 이 라든지 타 아도 대상 이 라든지 하 는 선동 을 여전히 계속 하 는 것 만 보		
15	text000001	UNDEF 그 는 ' 일본 사람 특유 ' 의 공손 하 ㄴ 인사 를 건네 ㄴ 뒤 ' 주 가고 시마	대한민국	명예 종영사 ' 란 글씨 가 크 게 박히 ㄴ 명함 을 자랑 스럽 게 내 어 놓 았 다 .		
16	text000001	UNDEF 문헌 상 의 사료 분량 이야 비슷 하 았 다고 하 아도	대한민국	이 처하 ㄴ 지리 적 여견 이 그렇 지 못하 았 지요 .		
17	text000001	_UNDEF	대한민국	예술상 수상 - 연극 무대 와 TV 를 오가 며 많 은 작품 을 하 시 었 는데 대충 몇 번 이나 되 ㄹㅈ		
18	text000001	응지 연기 또는 연출 로 동아연극상 2 번 , 백상 연극 영화상 3 번 , 비평가 그룹 상 2 번 그리 고	대한민국	예술상 등 을 받 았 습니다 .		
19	text000001	걸어가 ㄴ 오빠 ' 진상 가려 지 기전 세상떠나 할 말 없 어 새정부 내 각의 ' 여성 장관 3 명 ' 은	대한민국	초 유의 '사건 '이라고 여성 계선 환호 하 ㄴ다 .		
20	text000001	게 스웨터 갈 은 거 많이 입 잖아요 TV 에서 보 시 있 죠 박교 여기 가 외국 이 ㅂ니까 - 엄연히	대한민국	코리아 이 예요 문 화가 다르 구 인 식이 다르 ㅂ니다 어디 선 생이 티쪼가리에다 애 들 마냥 명		
21	text000001	UNDEF	대한민국	은 엄연히 헌법 이 있 는 법치 국가 아임매 ?		
22	text000001	UNDEF 두희 (아나운서 흉내) 혁명 정부 는 미래 의	대한민국	대통령 이창회 의 합격 을 축하 하 며 이창회 네 집 에 라디오 한 대 를 선물 하 기 로 하 았 습니		
23	text000002	_UNDEF_	대한민국	교통 경찰 의 이 참담 하 ㄴ 거수 경례 , 바로 만 원 짜리 경례 이 ㅂ니다 .		

Corpus-Based Discourse Analysis (CDA)

- CDA means analyzing and deconstructing concordance lines
 - concordances are the essence of discourses
- finding discourses: nodes + attitudes
 - (topic) nodes can be defined by keywords or (more generally) corpus queries
 - ▶ attitudes: *collocates* that are retrieved by statistical methods
- examples
 - "refugees as victims" (Baker, 2006)
 - "Fukushima as worst case scenario"

Corpus-Based Discourse Analysis (CDA)

- CDA means analyzing and deconstructing concordance lines
 - concordances are the essence of discourses
- finding discourses: nodes + attitudes
 - (topic) nodes can be defined by keywords or (more generally) corpus queries
 - ▶ attitudes: *collocates* that are retrieved by statistical methods
- examples
 - "refugees as victims" (Baker, 2006)
 - "Fukushima as worst case scenario"

in practice:

- look at (*n* best) collocates of topic node
- categorize into on-the-fly-groups

Collocations

Collocation controls							
Collocation based on:	Word form -	Statistic:	Log-likelihood ·				
Collocation window from:	3 to the Left ~	Collocation window to:	3 to the Right -				
Freq(node, collocate) at least	5 -	Freq(collocate) at least	5 ~				
Filter results by:	specific collocate:	and/or tag: (none) v	Submit changed parameters - Go!				

Extra information: Log-likelihood scores collocations by significance: the higher the score, the more evidence you have that the association is not due to chance. More frequent words lend to get higher log-likelihood scores, because there is more evidence for such words.

	There are 917 different words in your collocation database for "[word="대한민국"%c]". (Your query "대한민국" returned 290 matches in 12 different texts) [2.879 recently]							
No.	Word	Total no. in whole corpus	Expected collocate frequency	Observed collocate frequency	In no. of texts	Log-likelihood		
1	<u>정부</u>	10,078	0.762	<u>36</u>	9	207.941		
2	1948	107	0.008	Z	5	81.177		
3	<u> 수립</u>	910	0.069	<u>10</u>	5	79.886		
4	입사	704	0.053	9	4	74.623		
5	<u>대전</u>	1,217	0.092	<u>10</u>	2	74.092		
6	영토	311	0.024	Z	2	65.986		
7	역	481,078	36.381	<u>93</u>	12	63.243		
8	연극제	68	0.005	5	1	59.28		
9	에서	128,652	9.729	<u>41</u>	12	55.987		
10	국민	8,397	0.635	<u>12</u>	5	47.897		
11	고만	950	0.072	5	1	32.616		
12	<u>건축</u>	1,008	0.076	5	1	32.029		

15 / 32

Case Studies

- refugees (KhosraviNik, 2010)
 - "The representation of refugees, asylum seekers and immigrants in British newspapers: a critical discourse analysis."
 - CDA investigation on discursive strategies employed by various British newspapers between 1996-2006 in the ways they represent refugees, asylum seekers and immigrants.

Case Studies

- refugees (KhosraviNik, 2010)
 - "The representation of refugees, asylum seekers and immigrants in British newspapers: a critical discourse analysis."
 - CDA investigation on discursive strategies employed by various British newspapers between 1996-2006 in the ways they represent refugees, asylum seekers and immigrants.
- gender (Baker, 2014)
 - "Using Corpora to Analyze Gender"
 - collection of case studies wrt. changes in sexist and non-sexist language use over time, personal adverts, press representation of gay men, and the ways that boys and girls are constructed through language
- LGBT (Love and Baker, 2015)
 - "The hate that dare not speak its name?"
 - How have the British Parliamentary arguments against LGBT equality changed in response to decreasing social acceptability of discriminatory language against minority groups?

PhD project Exploring the Fukushima Effect

- identification and analysis of the tempo-spatial propagation of discourses in the transnational algorithmic public sphere
- case study: Fukushima Effect (cf. Gono'i, 2015)
 - attitudes and opinions towards energy sources
- data: mass and social media (German, Japanese)
 - intra- and transmedial and -national
 - "edited mass communication" vs. "mass self-communication"
- further information:
 - www.linguistik.fau.de/projects/efe/
 - funded by the Emerging Fields Initiative of FAU
 - ► Team:
 - * Chair of Computational Corpus Linguistics
 - ★ Chair of Japanese Studies
 - ★ Chair of Communication Science
 - ★ Chair of Visual Computing

Corpora – Social Media (Twitter)

German Twitter

- 10,266,835 original posts
- Inguistic annotation:
 - tokenization: SoMaJo (Proisl and Uhrig, 2016)
 - POS-tagging: SoMeWeTa (Proisl, 2018)
 - Iemmatization: work in progress

Japanese Twitter

- 411,452,027 original posts
- linguistic annotation:
 - special dictionary: ipadic-neologd (Sato et al., 2017)

Identification of Social Bots (Schäfer et al., 2017)

normalization of texts



- 2 mapping of normalized strings onto tweet ids
- extension: hierarchical clustering based on Levenshtein distance

Footprint of a Social Bot net number of near duplicates number of user accounts

Identification of Social Bots during the Japanese General Election of 2014



Philipp Heinrich, MSc (FAU)

Corpus-Based Discourse Analysis

Extensions

Visualization

- high-dimensional word embeddings (Word2Vec) (Mikolov et al., 2013)
 - based on shallow, two-layer neural networks
 - capturing co-occurrence information of words in 50–1000 dimensions
- t-distributed stochastic neighbour-embedding (t-SNE) (van der Maaten and Hinton, 2008)
 - project high-dimensional embeddings onto two-dimensional plane
 - semantically similar items are pre-grouped together
- size of lexical items represents association strength towards (topic) node (Evert, 2008)
 - different AMs retrieve different sets of collocates and sizes
- see Heinrich et al. (2018); Heinrich and Schäfer (2018)

Visualizing Collocational Profiles (node: Fukushima)

2011.03.12 - 2011.03.19 node: 5121.9 tw.p.m (29425/5744937)



Visualizing Collocational Profiles (node: Nuclear Phase-Out)



Higher-Order Collocates

- discourse collocates
 - straightforward generalization with respect to textual co-occurrence
 - look at co-occurrence frequencies of tweets that were identified to be part of the discourse at hand (topic + attitude)
 - collocates represent lexical items that are particularly important for the discourse

Higher-Order Collocates

- discourse collocates
 - straightforward generalization with respect to textual co-occurrence
 - look at co-occurrence frequencies of tweets that were identified to be part of the discourse at hand (topic + attitude)
 - collocates represent lexical items that are particularly important for the discourse
- escond-order topic-collocates
 - look at co-occurrence frequencies of one set of lexical items c in tweets that are about a certain topic t
 - ▶ for all w: compare co-occurrence frequencies of w with c among tweets that contain t with marginal frequencies of w in all tweets that contain t
 - collocates of c that are particulary important for the topic t

Second-Order Collocates



Figure: Paragraph-collocates of Germany in the FAZ corpus.

Second-Order Collocates



Figure: Collocates of Germany in energy-transition paragraphs.

Introduction

- Computational Corpus Linguistics
- Methods in CCL

2 Corpus-Based Discourse Analysis

- Basic Methodology
- Case Studies
- Extensions

3 The Future of CCL

- Deep Learning and CCL
- Towards a Hermeneutic Cyborg

Deep Learning and AI

- artificial neural networks
 - general end-to-end ML algorithms
 - origins in 1950s
 - recent hype due to improvements in processing power
- amazing performance in
 - visual object recognition
 - OCR
 - text categorization
 - machine translation
 - strategic games (Go)
 - simulating humans (Google assistant)

Deep Learning



Will human input become irrelevant?

- standard toolbox of corpus linguistics:
 - concordancing
 - frequencies and frequency comparison
 - collocations
- these techniques have been around for 50 years!
- Al techniques outperform humans when it comes to real-world applications
 - even the creation of gold-standard data (manual annotation) becomes less and less important
 - why bother with rule-based systems?

Digital Humanities



source: Voyant Tools

Towards a Hermeneutic Cyborg

interoperability

- query tool \rightarrow quantitative data \rightarrow visualization
- exchange quantitative results and manual grouping across systems

Towards a Hermeneutic Cyborg

interoperability

- query tool \rightarrow quantitative data \rightarrow visualization
- exchange quantitative results and manual grouping across systems

Interactivity

- integrate larger part of workflow into corpus software
- maintain connection to concordances
- implement visualization components in analysis tools

Towards a Hermeneutic Cyborg

interoperability

- query tool \rightarrow quantitative data \rightarrow visualization
- exchange quantitative results and manual grouping across systems

Interactivity

- integrate larger part of workflow into corpus software
- maintain connection to concordances
- implement visualization components in analysis tools

integration

- key challenge: how to feed back information from manual grouping into quantitative procedures?
- applied to CDA: how to update discourse embeddings?

Mixed-Methods Discourse Analysis



Thanks for listening. **Questions?**

References

P. Baker. Using Corpora to Analyze Gender. Bloomsbury Publishing, 2014.

Paul Baker. Using Corpora in Discourse Analysis. Continuum, London, 2006.

Stefan Evert. Corpora and collocations. In Anke Lüdeling and Merja Kytö, editors, Corpus Linguistics. An International Handbook, chapter 58. Mouton de Gruyter, Berlin, 2008.

J.R. Firth. Papers in linguistics, 1934-1951. Oxford University Press, 1957.

Michel Foucault. L'Archéologie du savoir. Éditions Gallimard, Paris, 1969.

- Ikuo Gono'i. 2015-nen ANPO, Minshushugi wo futatabi hajimeru wakamono-tachi (ANPO in 2015. The Youth that is restarting Democracy), 2015.
- Philipp Heinrich and Fabian Schäfer. Extending corpus-based discourse analysis for exploring japanese social media. In *Proceedings of the Asia Pacific Corpus Linguistics Conference 2018*, 2018.
- Philipp Heinrich, Christoph Adrian, Olena Kalashnikova, Fabian Schäfer, and Stefan Evert. A Transnational Analysis of News and Tweets about Nuclear Phase-Out in the Aftermath of the Fukushima Incident. In Andreas Witt, Jana Diesner, and Georg Rehm, editors, Proceedings of the LREC 2018 'Workshop on Computational Impact Detection from Text Data", Paris, 2018. ELRA.
- Majid KhosraviNik. The representation of refugees, asylum seekers and immigrants in british newspapers : a critical discourse analysis. *Journal of Language and Politics*, 9(1):1–28, 2010.
- Robbie Love and Paul Baker. The hate that dare not speak its name? *Journal of Language Aggression and Conflict*, 3(1):57–86, October 2015.

Tomas Mikolov, Kai Chen, Greg Corrado, and Jeffrey Dean. Efficient estimation of word representations in vector space. *CoRR*, abs/1301.3781, 2013.

Philipp Heinrich, MSc (FAU)

Corpus-Based Discourse Analysis

- Thomas Proisl. SoMeWeTa: A Part-of-Speech Tagger for German Social Media and Web Texts. In *Proceedings of the Eleventh International Conference on Language Resources and Evaluation (LREC'18)*, 2018.
- Thomas Proisl and Peter Uhrig. SoMaJo: State-of-the-art tokenization for German web and social media texts. In Paul Cook, Stefan Evert, Roland Schäfer, and Egon Stemle, editors, *Proceedings of the 10th Web as Corpus Workshop (WAC-X) and the EmpiriST Shared Task*, pages 57–62, Berlin, 2016. Association for Computational Linguistics.
- Toshinori Sato, Taiichi Hashimoto, and Manabu Okumura. Implementation of a word segmentation dictionary called mecab-ipadic-neologd and study on how to use it effectively for information retrieval (in japanese). In *Proceedings of the Twenty-three Annual Meeting of the Association for Natural Language Processing*, pages NLP2017–B6–1. The Association for Natural Language Processing, 2017.
- Fabian Schäfer, Stefan Evert, and Philipp Heinrich. Japan's 2014 General Election: Political Bots, Right-Wing Internet Activism and PM Abe Shinzō's Hidden Nationalist Agenda. *Big Data*, 5:1 – 16, 2017.
- L.J.P van der Maaten and G.E. Hinton. Visualizing High-Dimensional Data Using t-SNE. *Journal of Machine Learning Research*, 9:2579–2605, 2008.